

**FINAL MEETING MINUTES**  
**MARICOPA ASSOCIATION OF GOVERNMENTS**  
**TRANSIT COMMITTEE**

February 21, 2017 - 2:00 p.m.  
Maricopa Association of Governments; Saguaro Room;  
302 N. 1<sup>st</sup> Avenue, Suite 200  
Phoenix, Arizona

**MEMBERS ATTENDING**

\*ADOT: Clem Ligocki  
Avondale: Kristen Taylor, Vice Chair  
Buckeye: Sean Banda for Andrea Marquez  
Chandler: Jason Crampton  
#El Mirage: Janeen Gaskins  
Gila River Indian Community, Greg McDowell  
Gilbert: Kristin Myers  
Glendale: Matthew Dudley for Debbie Albert  
\*Goodyear: Christine McMurdy  
#Maricopa: David Maestas  
Maricopa County DOT: Reed Kempton

#Mesa: Jodi Sorrell  
\*Paradise Valley: Jeremy Knapp  
Peoria: Stuart Kent  
Phoenix: Maria Hyatt, Chair  
\*Queen Creek: Vacant  
Scottsdale: Gregory P. Davies  
Surprise: Martín Lucero  
Tempe: Robert Yabes  
\*Tolleson: Vacant  
Valley Metro: Abhishek Dayal  
#Youngtown: Grant Anderson

\* Members neither present nor represented  
by proxy.

# Participated (or attended) by teleconference  
+ Participated (or attended) by videoconference

**OTHERS PRESENT**

Audra Koester Thomas, MAG  
Marc Pearsall, MAG  
Alice Chen, MAG  
Teri Kennedy, MAG  
Tarranique Nuness, MAG

Jeff Martin, Chandler/Mesa  
Liza Golden, MCDPH  
Rhonda Humbles, Peoria  
Ken Kessler, Phoenix  
Jorie Bresnahan, Phoenix  
Carol Ketcherside, Valley Metro  
Howard May, transit advocate  
Randy Overmyer, CivTech  
Marta Gerber, Michael Baker

### 1. Call to Order

The meeting was called to order at 2:06 p.m. by Chair Maria Hyatt. She welcomed everyone in attendance and announced that a quorum was present. She noted that several members were joining the meeting by teleconference: Janeen Gaskins of El Mirage, David Maestas of Maricopa, Jodi Sorrell of Mesa, and Grant Anderson of Youngtown. She asked if there were any further comment, and hearing none, proceeded to the next item on the agenda.

### 2. Approval of Draft January 17, 2017 Meeting Minutes

Chair Hyatt inquired if there were any comments or corrections to the Draft January 17, 2017 Minutes. Hearing no comments, she called for a motion to approve the Draft January 17, 2017 Minutes. Martin Lucero of Surprise moved to approve the motion, Robert Yabes of Tempe seconded, and the motion passed unanimously. Chair Hyatt then proceeded to the next item on the agenda.

### 3. Call to the Audience

Chair Hyatt stated that she had received one public comment-request to speak card from the audience. She proceeded with a call to the audience, and Mr. Howard May elected to address the Committee. Mr. May stated that he supported bus service in Phoenix and other parts of the Valley and noted that many bus stops throughout the system featured poor lighting due to excess vandalism that has negatively affected the lighting components. He advised that for safety reasons this issue be addressed through better maintenance and inspections.

Chair Hyatt thanked Mr. May for his input and then proceeded to the next item on the agenda.

### 4. Transit Planning Report

Chair Hyatt introduced the MAG Transit Planning Project Manager, Audra Koester Thomas.

Ms. Koester Thomas explained that the MAG Regional Transit Framework Study Update was moving along at a solid pace with consultant Nelson\Nygaard. She added that they were planning a meeting regarding the RTFS Update with stakeholders for either March 8th or 9<sup>th</sup>. The goal was to provide technical updates, data collection and project administrative activities to the team. In the future, ongoing briefings with stakeholders to be facilitated at key milestones.

She noted that for the MAG Regional Commuter Rail System Study Update, MAG had finalized contract negotiations with the AECOM team. Initial data collection was just underway, and was largely a technical update of the 2010 Regional Commuter Rail System Study. Marc Pearsall would be meeting with interested member agencies this spring/summer. She also noted that the ADOT Tucson-Phoenix Passenger Rail Study received its Record of Decision (ROD) from the Federal Railroad Administration in January 2017. This concluded six years of study with the completion of

the Tier 1 EIS process, and enabled ADOT to proceed into the Tier 2 EIS phase, however at present there no state or federal funding allocated for the project. The public review period would end March 10, 2017.

She also welcomed back returning Committee member Clem Ligocki, who would now be representing ADOT. She also said that she planned to solicit a poll for gauging interest of committee members who wish to visit and tour Valley Metro's Mobility Center in East Phoenix sometime in the spring. She offered to send out some potential dates to schedule a tour of the Mobility Center. Chair Hyatt thanked Ms. Koester Thomas and asked if there were further questions or comments regarding the agenda item. Hearing no further comments, she proceeded to the next item on the agenda.

5. Changes to a Regionally Significant Project within the Draft FY 2018-2022 Transportation Improvement Program, Draft 2040 Regional Transportation Plan, and Amendment to the FY 2017-2021 MAG Transportation Improvement Program and Amendment to the Draft 2035 Regional Transportation Plan, and Will Undergo Necessary Air Quality Conformity Analysis.

Chair Hyatt invited Mr. Marc Pearsall of MAG to brief the Committee the agenda item. Mr. Pearsall stated that he was giving a brief presentation on requests for date revisions of regionally significant projects.

Mr. Pearsall stated that the first request was for the Gilbert Road Light Rail Extension, in order to revise its opening date to 2019 from 2018 due to additional roadway improvements and enhancements by Mesa and Valley Metro. He also explained that the second request was to revise the opening date of the Peoria Transit Center and Phase II of the park-and-ride lot from 2019 to 2026. He noted that the park-and-ride lot did not need to be constructed until there was more transit demand and additional services available in the area. Mr. Pearsall stated that these two projects would join an earlier request from the January 2017 agenda, which called for a six month delay for the Tempe Streetcar to 2020 from 2019, as all three would be forwarded to Regional Council for action in the coming month.

He then briefly summarized the agenda action to: change the revised opening dates within the Draft FY 2018-2022 Transportation Improvement Program, Draft 2040 Regional Transportation Plan, and Amendment to the FY 2017-2021 MAG Transportation Improvement Program and Amendment to the Draft 2035 Regional Transportation Plan, and will undergo necessary air quality conformity analysis. He then completed his presentation.

Chair Hyatt proceeded with a call to the audience, and Mr. Howard May elected to address the Committee. Mr. May explained that he supported the deferrals of both the Gilbert Road Extension (GRE) and the Peoria Transit Center and Phase II of the Park-and-Ride as they were necessary at this time. He also added that Peoria transit passengers would benefit greatly if the bus and transit service was expanded within Peoria and Northwest Valley, especially during later evening hours.

Chair Hyatt again thanked Mr. Pearsall and Mr. May and asked if there were further questions or comments regarding the agenda item. Hearing no further comments, she called for a motion to approve the item. Mr. Martin Lucero of Surprise moved to approve the motion, Mr. Matthew Dudley of Glendale seconded, and the motion passed unanimously. Chair Hyatt then proceeded to the next item on the agenda.

## 6. Regional Transit Survey Review Update

Chair Hyatt invited Ms. Alice Chen of MAG to present on the Regional Transit Survey Review. Ms. Chen then referred to her brief presentation.

Ms. Chen explained that the survey responses from the previous cycle would be included in anything discussed during the committee meeting. Project candidates and details were contingent on what Congress would approve for Federal Funding apportionment in late April 2017, which would in turn help the region gauge the priorities in the list of projects. She then explained the premise behind the June 2016 Regional Programming Guidelines for Federal Transit Formula Funds: Under Section 500 - Transportation Programming Priorities: Item 8, that it stipulated that the region should 'Fund additional projects based through a collaborative process by assessing regional transit needs, implementing elements of adopted regional efforts and meeting regional performance based criteria.'

She then reviewed the transit programming schedule from November/ December 2016 through June 28, 2017. She advised on the Regional Transit Survey Responses for FY2016, and for those projects submitted in Fiscal Year 2015 (for funding in Fiscal Years 2016-2021). She also referred to "Priority 8" Projects Funded as part of FY 2016-2021 TIP, which were approved by MAG Regional Council on June 22, 2016. She also detailed the Regional Transit Survey Responses, the FY2017 responses as of February 21, 2017 (for the Fiscal Years 2017-2022 Transportation Improvement Program). She then detailed "Priority 8" Scenarios - with a contingency list of projects for possible inclusion in the FY 2017-2022 TIP.

Ms. Chen concluded by explaining that the item was on the agenda for information, discussion, and recommended approval of contingent list of projects for inclusion in the FY 2017-2022 Transportation Improvement Program. Chair Hyatt again thanked Ms. Chen and asked if there were further questions or comments regarding the agenda item.

The first comment was from Chair Hyatt. Chair Hyatt and Mr. Kent discussed expansion buses and where they would be allocated, as well as the timing of buses since they would arrive within two years. Mr. Crampton noted that through the SRTP, all members should work jointly with other agency members in order to get better service needs on the street. He also requested Mr. Dayal to check on fleet availability as to see where additional fleet service could be implemented in the region. It was requested that an array of scenarios could be explored in order to see what expansion routes could be put into service, especially in light of likely apportionment of buses later this year.

Mr. Dayal and Chair Hyatt discussed those scenarios that may give the region express bus expansion routes, while Mr. Kent inquired on what was the likely apportionment of funds for express buses in addition to the funds already approved this year. There was also discussion regarding ADA project valuation and the Regional Council's future approval of the ATAN process, with Ms. Koester Thomas and Mr. Kent further commenting.

Ms. Chen noted that the Grand Avenue project was included in the survey implementation for 2018 funding, both for project and operations. Mr. Lucero was waiting on Valley Metro and the consultant for the completed Grand Avenue transit report, and noted that there no dollar amount for the Route 570 Grand Ave yet. Ms. Koester Thomas noted that the initial survey was for capital projects, but not operations. Mr. Dayal noted that he would get back to Mr. Lucero regarding the status of the Grand Avenue study after speaking with Valley Metro staff. Ms. Chen replied the project was included in the survey with implementation 2018 funding for project report opening. Mr. Kent asked for clarification regarding Route 83 (83<sup>rd</sup> Ave) funding. Chair Hyatt noted details of scenario three, and additional commentary was provided by Mr. Crampton for crafting a hybrid of two and three, with a scenario 2b.

Mr. Crampton inquired about the competitive process for agencies regarding bus stop projects. Ms. Myers also inquired about ADA close-out. Chair Hyatt noted that she did not know where the additional expansion buses would go within the system and Ms. Koester Thomas mentioned an ADA bus stop notation at the bottom of the slide. Additional comments were received from Mr. Yabes, Chair Hyatt and Mr. Crampton regarding the hybrid scenarios. Mr. Yabes further commented on the \$655,000 for expansion buses, and asked about scenario 2 and its three buses, ITS, ADA and ramps allocation. Mr. Lucero wondered if some could be shifted towards Grand Avenue service, and Ms. Chen replied that it could be discussed further at the TIP/POP review and SRTP presentation to the Board in April.

Chair Hyatt again thanked Ms. Chen and the member agencies for their input and asked if there were any further questions or comments regarding the agenda item. She then summarized the four scenarios and reminded that the motion required action. Final comments were may by Mr. Lucero and Mr. Kent, and Ms. Gaskins and Ms. Taylor had questions regarding ATAN and ADA clarification. Chair Hyatt advised that in light of the four distinct scenarios, that the committee should take a hand vote in order to select the preferred scenario. No votes were cast for scenario 1 and 2, four votes were cast for scenario 2b, and 12 votes were cast for the scenario 3, which was preferred by a majority of the members. Hearing no further comments, she called for a motion to approve the scenario 3. Mr. Abhi Dayal of Valley Metro moved to approve the motion, Ms. Kristin Myers of Gilbert seconded, and the motion passed unanimously. Chair Hyatt then proceeded to the next item on the agenda.

#### 7. Recommended Fiscal Year 2017 Program of Projects, Working Draft Fiscal Year 2018 Program of Projects and Fiscal Year 2018-2022 Transportation Improvement Program

Chair Hyatt invited Ms. Chen to continue with the next agenda item. Ms. Chen explained that in fiscal year 2017, MAG staff, in coordination with the MAG Transit Committee, the City of Phoenix

and Valley Metro would be developing the FY 2017 Program of Projects (POP) and FY 2018-2022 Transportation Improvement Program (TIP). She advised that the Program of Projects was developed annually and ensures that the public was informed and has continued involvement in the development of the Transportation Improvement Program. Per MAG's Public Participation Plan, the MAG public participation process satisfies the grantee's public participation requirements for the POP. She then referred the members to the attachment #2.

She then reviewed some of the key elements of the draft TIP project listings attachment: FY 2017–2021 project listings with updated with Federal Administration and Federal Highway Administration apportionments; the TIP was updated with Draft FY 2022 Transit Life Cycle projects listings; Laveen Park-and-Ride cost restored from \$2,800,710/\$169,290 federal/regional to \$4,970,453/\$1,234,323 due to the savings no longer being realized from being part of the South Mountain Freeway project. She said this reflected the original cost of the project; bus capital expansion originally for FY 2017 moved to FY 2022 (due to the cost of Laveen Park and Ride).

Ms. Chen also explained that unless there were project deferrals or close-out funding available, FY 2017-2021 was fully programmed to projected federal apportionment: There was \$1.5 Million set-aside in fiscal years 2018-2021 available for future discussions on programming priorities. Priorities may include restoring the Job Access and Reverse Commute (JARC) program or to continue funding ADA related and/or bus stop accessibility improvements; Federally allocated funds for ADA Accessibility/Achieving Transit Access Now (ATAN) would be swapped out with regional Public Transportation Funds (PTF).

She noted that this swap would not increase or decrease funding to PTF but would instead allow agencies to utilize ATAN funds without needing to meet federal requirements; Avondale-Goodyear Urbanized Area funding discussions were on-going. FY 2022 was currently under programmed by approximately \$3 million. She then concluded by noting the next steps: which included reconciling the programming priorities with federal funded projects and the Transit Life Cycle program projects for FY 2017-2022 and that action would be required for the February Transit Committee agenda.

Chair Hyatt again thanked Ms. Chen and asked if there were further questions or comments regarding the agenda item. Brief discussion occurred between Chair Hyatt, Vice Chair Taylor, Mr. Lucero and Mr. Yabes regarding funding apportionments and the Draft 2040 RTP.

Chair Hyatt again thanked Ms. Chen and asked if there were further questions or comments regarding the agenda item. Hearing none, she proceeded to the next item on the agenda.

#### 8. Semiannual Status Report on Federal Grant Activity

Chair Hyatt invited Ken Kessler of the City of Phoenix to present the item. He reminded that Phoenix was the Designated Recipient (DR) for federal transit funds for the Phoenix-Mesa Urbanized Area (UZA). Among other responsibilities, Phoenix managed federal transit grants for the region and in support of MAG's role of coordinating regional transit planning and programming activities.

Mr. Kessler stated that the City of Phoenix provided semiannual status updates to the Transit Committee for existing federal grants, the most recent as of December 31, 2016. Chair Hyatt, Ken Kessler and Ms. Koester Thomas noted that they wished to continue the Committee conversation about the current status of unspent federal grants in the region. They noted that re-prioritizing these funds should become a priority. He explained that there were forty-six active grants, totaling a \$958.1 million award value, with \$242.5 million unspent (25.3%). He added that one grant still had \$2.4 million from FFY 2005, and six grants totaling \$6.9 million were over six years old.

He added that eleven grants totaling \$28.7 million were over five years old. Projects such as park and rides, transit centers, vehicles, operating assistance, preventive maintenance were allocated the following amounts, respectively: \$175K FFY 2013, \$1.4M FFY 2014, and \$4.2M FFY 2015 for the Regional Transit Communications Project. Mr. Kessler also referenced a graph for unspent expenditures and remaining federal funds between 2012-2016.

Chair Hyatt acknowledged that the region must collectively change and improved our funding management. Mr. Crampton concurred. Mr. Davies commented that much progress had been made on the Mustang Park And Ride and that a funding contract would soon be ready for Scottsdale. Mr. Dudley then commented on FTA Region 9 reallocation of funding. Ms. Koester Thomas thanked Phoenix for the follow-up from many months ago and noted that many steps had been taken by the member agencies on better grant management, and directed kudos for Phoenix for working with Mr. Davies and Scottsdale as well as other cities on grant management and close out. Additional comments were made by Ms. Myers and Ms. Sorrel regarding IGAs.

Chair Hyatt thanked Mr. Kessler and the members for their input and asked if there were further questions or comments regarding the agenda item. Hearing none, she proceeded to the next item on the agenda.

#### 9. Request for Future Agenda Items

Chair Hyatt asked the members of the Committee if there were any issues or topics that they would like added as future agenda items. Hearing no further comments, Chair Hyatt proceeded to the next item on the agenda.

#### 10. Next Meeting Date

Chair Hyatt thanked those in attendance and announced that the next scheduled meeting of the MAG Transit Committee, if needed, would be held on Tuesday, March 21, 2017, at 2:00 p.m. in the MAG Office, Saguaro Room.

There being no further business, she adjourned the meeting at 3:26 p.m.